

Concept Design Report November 2020

## Appendix B: Site Selection Recommendation



To: City of Yellowknife Project: Yellowknife Aquatics Centre

Attn: Grant White Project no. 19-022

Cc: Scott McFadyen, Colliers Project Leaders Location: Yellowknife, NT From: Melani Korver Date: July 2, 2020

Re: Recommendation for Site Selection

## Recommendation

The Aquatics Centre Predesign Plan recommended two sites for consideration for the new Aquatics Centre in Yellowknife:

- Site 1: east of existing Ruth Inch Memorial Pool (old Pitch and Putt site)
- Site 2: south of the Fieldhouse & Multiplex

Based on the site comparison undertaken by Taylor Architecture group and described below, TAG strongly recommends that the **existing RIMP site is selected for the new Aquatics Centre in Yellowknife**. This site encompasses lower financial risk to the City in terms of foundation costs, and greater opportunities in terms of complimentary amenities and accessibility to the public.

## **Site Selection Process**

In order to compare the technical feasibility of each site, the City of Yellowknife retained three study reports for each site:

- Desktop Geotechnical Evaluation (prepared by Tetra Tech, submitted May 20, 2020)
- Phase 1 Environmental Site Assessment (prepared by Tetra Tech, submitted May 2, 2020)
- Preliminary Traffic and Parking Study (prepared by Creative Transportation Solutions, submitted June 29, 2020)

Taylor Architecture Group used the information contained in these three reports to develop a list of criteria that were scored and weighted in a site selection matrix, comparing the two sites. Additional criteria that TAG felt differentiated the two sites were also captured in the matrix. The comparison shows that the Ruth Inch Memorial Pool site scored higher in every category (Geotechnical Report, Environmental Report, Traffic Report and Additional Criteria), resulting in the following total weighted scores:

Multiplex/Fieldhouse Site Score 75 RIMP Site Score 103

Please see the attached site selection matrix for detailed information regarding the evaluation.

Sincerely,

Melani Korver
melani@tagyk.com
TAYLOR ARCHITECTURE GROUP

## **Yellowknife Aquatics Centre - Site Selection Matrix**

Score: 1 = poor Multiplex/Fieldhouse Site RIMP Site (pitch & putt) Multiplex/Fieldhouse **RIMP Site** 2 = fair **Scoring Reasoning** Weight Score Total Score Total Criteria **Criteria Description** 3 = good**Geotechnical Report** Surface conditions Mix of bedrock outcrop in NW corner, to Site largely covered by exposed bedrock: Consistent surface conditions 4 2 2 3 6 Total = organic material and vegetation. Drainage Two large rock outcrops and some sand across site is preferable; exposed weight x score ditch runs through the east end of the in north part of site pedrock is preferable Bedrock profile Bedrock ranges from outcropping at NW Two rock outcrops (max. 3m above Bedrock close to the surface is 2 2 4 3 6 corner of site (max 8m above parking lot parking lot elevation), and ranging from preferable; low exposed bedrock elevation), to at least 9m deep (based on 0.3m-2.7m below grade elsewhere on is preferable (less blasting borehole samples). Suggested that site (based on borehole samples) required) bedrock may dip steeply under a portion Bearing capacity of soil N/A (no soil; bedrock has highest bearing Soil with high bearing capacity, 2 1 2 3 6 Low capacity) or exposed bedrock is preferable Minimal groundwater is Groundwater present Yes - in drainage ditch at east end of site res - at lowest point between rock 3 1 3 3 9 acts as path for groundwater flow through outcrops (this likely acts as a drainage referable path for groundwater flow towards culverts under Kam Lake Road and frame lake). Note manhole located at through the site towards the southeast. Drainage ditch will require relocation vest end of site - may require relocation Anticipated Permafrost No permafrost is preferable 3 9 9 3 Shallow foundation is preferable **Foundation Options** Rock socketed steel piles or Shallow foundation: Strip and spread concrete footings to bedrock most cost effective) strip and spread concrete footings, depending on depth to bedrock May also use rock socketed steel piles or mix of the two types Additional testing required Recommend additional boreholes drilled Recommend additional boreholes drilled No additional testing is 1 2 2 2 2 at centre and east portions of site along trail running through the two oreferable outcrops Subtotal 30 47 **Environmental Report** Historical spills historical petroleum hydrocarbon spill at historical petroleum spill at Esso gas No historical spills, or spills 4 3 6 Fieldhouse parking lot, directly east of site station, 90m SE of site located offsite are preferable Additional testing required Recommend additional testing Recommend additional testing No additional testing is 1 2 2 2 2 Subtotal 8 6 Traffic Report No traffic adjustments are Traffic adjustments None Westbound approach on Forrest Drive 2 3 6 2 4 vould be near capacity with site traffic oreferable added - resolve with westbound left Parking defecit: -4 stalls during weekdays; Parking surplus: +37 stalls during Parking capacity Adequate or surplus parking is 3 2 6 3 9 78 stalls during Satudays veekdays; +13 stalls during Saturday oreferable Limited sidewalk access at Kam Lake Pedestrian connectivity High degree of pedestrian Site is directly adjacent to Frame Lake 2 2 4 3 6 Rd/Old Airport Rd intersection, and only Trail system, and Franklin Avenue (full connectivity is preferable partial sidewalk along Kam Lake Rd. Site is currently geared towards arrival by vehicle. Cycling connectivity Cycling route on Kam Lake south of Cycling route on Franklin south of Forrest High degree of cycling 2 2 4 3 6 nd Forrest east of Franklin Woolgar onnectivity is preferable Near westbound stop for Route B and 4 Transit connectivity Near northbound and southbound stops Served by multiple routes is 2 2 6 or Route A and Route B (2 routes) Route B express oreferable Subtotal 24 31 Additional Criteria Proximity to other recreational Multiplex, Fieldhouse, Arctic Indigenous YK Community Arena, YK Curling Centre, Close proximity to other facilities 2 4 3 6 2 and cultural amenities Wellness Camp RIMP building, tennis courts, volleyball s preferable courts, McNiven park & playground, Frame Lake Trail Impact on existing site activities None Pitch and putt removed (not currently Minimal impact on existing site 1 3 3 2 2 used), relocation of recycling containers, activities is preferable relocation of trail running through the Additional Site Work Parking lot between Fieldhouse and Site is Parking lot requires levelling and Minimal additional site work is 2 2 4 2 4 inpaved. Consider paving. esurfacing referable Views from the site/new building Potential views to Kam Lake Road, Potential views to Frame Lake and trail liews to natural settings are 1 2 2 3 3 concrete plant, residential neighbourhood system, RIMP building, Franklin Ave oreferable and Multiplex/Fieldhouse, Potential view to forested area to the east. Site Context & Architectural Multiplex & Fieldhouse are boxy, RIMP, Curling Centre and Arena are Architectural potential is 2 2 Potential industrial buildings that do not necessarily lower scale buildings. Proximity to frame somewhat subjective. RIMP site respond to site; site is geared towards lake trail requires a more "human scale" has more context (architectural and landscape) that it must arrival by vehicle. building design respond to, whereas Fieldhouse site is more of a "blank slate" site 15 Subtotal

	Multiplex/Fieldhouse	RIMP Site
Total Weighted Score	75	103

(highest score wins)